

Association of Bay Area Governments
Bay Area Air Quality Management District
Bay Conservation and Development Commission
Metropolitan Transportation Commission

Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter 101 Eighth Street P.O. Box 2050 Oakland, CA 94607-4756 (510) 464-7942 fax: (510) 433-5542 tedd@abag.ca.gov www.abag.ca.gov/jointpolicy

JOINT POLICY COMMITTEE — REGIONAL PLANNING PROGRAM

Date: May 8, 2008

To: Joint Policy Committee

From: Regional Planning Program Director

Subject: Progress on Regional Agency Climate Protection Program

At its meeting in May of 2007, the JPC received a report recommending a Bay Area Regional Agency Climate Protection Program. The Committee acted on those recommendations at its July meeting. As a year has now passed since the introduction of the program proposal, it is appropriate to assess progress. Two attachments to this memo are intended to assist Committee members in this assessment. Attachment A records climate-change activities by each JPC member agency. Attachment B tracks these activities against each of the strategy elements and recommendations in the 2007 program proposal.

In sum, the regional agencies, individually and collectively, have made remarkable progress over the past year. Of particular note are:

- The incorporation of climate change and CO₂ reduction as central considerations in the current Regional Transportation Plan (RTP) update;
- The award of \$3 million in climate protection grants;
- The high level of interest which has been generated among local governments and others in developing strategies to respond to sea-level rise in the Bay;
- The increasing receptivity to carbon-reducing development, as indicated by the high participation rate in the FOCUS priority development area (PDA) initiative;
- Legislative interest in funding regional climate initiatives through a gasoline fee.

However, reflective of the growing scientific, public and political urgency accorded the climate-change issue, there is still a great deal of work remaining to be done. Noting that agency resources have not increased appreciably to encompass the climate imperative and that few if any traditional activities have been jettisoned to make room for climate work, there is a particular need to rationalize climate activities among agencies and between the region and others undertaking closely related initiatives. Forging appropriate partnerships and agreeing on specific divisions of labor are priorities for the forthcoming year. Beginning to address adaptation to other climate impacts, in addition to sea-level rise, is also a priority.

Regional Agency Climate Change Activities

Association of Bay Area Governments Climate Change Activities March 2008

1. Overseeing the **FOCUS Initiative's** initial implementation phase. Developing a FY 08-09 work plan with MTC that will feature planning grants and targeted support for the priority development areas (PDA's). Currently, soliciting applications for FY 07-08 Station Area and FOCUS Planning Grant Program—\$7.5 million available (grants up to \$750,000) for localized planning efforts and associated environmental impact reports, and for specific plan elements. Also, ABAG is offering two local governments \$20K-\$60K grants to engage low-income communities in their planning processes.

http://www.bayareavision.org/index.html http://www.bayareavision.org/initiatives/incentives.html#sappgrants

- 2. Policy-Based *Projections*: Since 2003, ABAG's *Projections* have been a "policy-based" population, household and jobs forecast, as opposed to a traditional "trend-based" forecast. Policy is reflected in the forecast through the assumptions about the location and density of future growth. These assumptions are based on the policy statements adopted by ABAG's Executive Board in 2002, at the completion of the *Smart Growth Strategy Livability Footprint Project*. As policy-based projections, the land-use forecast is the most complete and detailed expression of the region's land-use policies, namely to direct more growth to urbanized areas with transit and existing jobs. Increased housing and employment densities near transit can effectively reduce VMT and therefore carbon emissions through increased access to public transit and through more walkable communities.
- 3. Land Use Targets: For the *Projections* 2009 forecast, ABAG's Executive Board will consider adopting performance measures. Most measures are related to climate change, including reducing VMT, carbon emissions and particulate matter. Performance targets are being proposed as part of the *Projections* process to facilitate direct conversations with local governments and regional decision makers about land use's role in reducing VMTs and emissions. Alternative land use scenarios will be developed and tested against the targets. The results of these tests will be vetted through local and regional leaders. ABAG will also monitor land-use related progress toward Climate Change and other targets.
- 4. Regional Housing Needs Allocation: Every five years the state determines the amount of housing each metropolitan region needs and therefore must plan for. ABAG, in partnership with a committee of local governments and housing advocates, allocates that need to each jurisdiction. Local governments must then plan for this need in the housing elements of their General Plans. ABAG's 2007-2014 allocation of the regional need to local governments is very progressive in directing housing toward

urbanized areas, transit and existing job centers. This allocation is intended to advance regional environmental objectives, including Climate Change. More housing planned in cities with transit and existing jobs means potentially less driving and therefore less emissions. Actual housing production by jurisdiction, relative to local RHNA allocations, is tracked in an annual housing report.

- 5. Exploring joint development (with Air District and other partners) of **local government outreach program** for best practices/benchmarks for carbon reduction at local level. Could include ICLEI and Institute for Local Governments (ILG). This effort would make good use of ABAG's excellent local government network.
- 6. Coordinating the **Bay Area Green Business Program** which verifies that businesses meet higher standards of environmental performance. Partnership of government agencies and utilities helps local businesses comply with all environmental regulations and take actions to conserve resources, prevent pollution, minimize waste, and reduce GHG emissions. Aimed towards small to medium-sized consumeroriented businesses. 1200 businesses and public agencies certified to date; adding 400 new businesses per year. Developing measurement tool that will quantify environmental benefits, including GHG emissions reductions. Free service. Includes on-site visits by county coordinator, PG&E, Smart Lights or other expert. Program focuses on critical near-term emissions reduction. ABAG coordinator about .3 FTE.

Program developed by Bay Area local governments in collaboration with US EPA, Cal EPA Department of Toxic Substances Control and the business community. ABAG coordinates with implementation by Green Business Coordinators in 9 participating counties. The regional and local programs are funded by local and regional government agencies, utilities, special districts and nonprofit organizations that promote environmental compliance, pollution prevention and resource conservation. Some funding also comes from government and non-profit foundation grants.

http://www.abag.ca.gov/bayarea/enviro/gbus/gb.html

- 7. Working with BCDC, JPC and National Estuarine Research Reserve on **sea level rise workshop** on April 19 for local planning and public works staff, water districts, water treatment facilities, flood control districts, resource and park managers.
- 8. Operating the ABAG **Energy Watch** program, a partnership with PG&E that seeks to implement energy efficiency projects within local government facilities, and provides policy assistance to improve energy efficiency in the broader communities. Part of this assistance quantifies GHG reductions from energy efficiency efforts. Individual consulting, group workshops and printed materials. Includes city and county governments and special districts. Program helps organizations to identify, fund and implement projects. Funded by utility ratepayers under the CPUC. Sixty-four local governments have received services since 2004. Free services. http://www.abag.ca.gov/abagenergywatch/index.html

- 9. Operating **ABAG POWER** (ABAG Publicly Owned Energy Resources), a separate joint powers agency formed to take advantage of the current energy regulatory environment. Primary goal is to conduct pooled purchasing of natural gas and electricity on behalf of local governments and special districts who voluntarily join the Pool. Pooled purchasing enables local governments to achieve more competitive pricing from suppliers who are interested in larger and more attractive combined loads. At this time, ABAG POWER is principally interested in aggregating local government loads only. The Pool is currently purchasing natural gas for 38 local governments and special districts in the Bay Area. The group is also looking at a program to assist local governments with solar project implementation. Electricity purchases were suspended in 2001. http://www.abag.ca.gov/services/power/
- 10. Running the second annual **Growing Smarter Together Awards** to recognize excellence in planning and development by local governments. Deadline is March 7 with awards program on April 24. http://www.abag.ca.gov/smarter.html
- 11. Exploring possible **new strategies** and roles that could reduce GHGs:
 - ❖ Find implementation resources that cities badly need to retrofit older buildings.
 - ❖ Find additional funding for Green Business Program to: add staff in each county so more businesses could be assisted; complete development of measurement tool; expand marketing.
 - ❖ Possible expanded use of Build It Green green-point rating system.
 - ❖ Help all cities to create local ordinances on green building.
 - ❖ Work with EPA on their Energy Solutions (beta program).
 - ❖ Tabbed guidance book for local governments on all info and service providers related to climate change.
 - ❖ Helping cities to design and develop more climate-resilient communities (preparation for higher temperatures, sea level rise, water shortages, electricity supply issues, worsening air quality, etc.)

Bay Air Quality Management District Climate Change Activities March 2008

- 1. In 2005, the Air District initiated a **Climate Protection Program**. On June 1, 2005 the Air District Board of Directors adopted a resolution establishing a Climate Protection Program and acknowledging the link between climate protection and programs to reduce air pollution in the Bay Area. The Board of Directors also formed a standing Committee on Climate Protection to provide direction on District climate protection activities. http://www.baaqmd.gov/pln/climatechange.htm#district
- 2. In 2006, the District designed and conducted a **Regional Climate Protection Summit** in San Francisco featuring Vice President Al Gore. 500+ attendees also heard Michel Gelobter, Steve Heminger, Carl Guardino and other regional leaders.

- 3. In 2006, the District conducted a comprehensive **inventory** of Bay Area GHG emissions from all sources. Total emissions in the base year (2002) were estimated at 85 million metric tons of CO2-e. Currently the District is updating the inventory to the 2005 base year. See Bay Area Emission Inventory at: http://www.baaqmd.gov/pln/climatechange.htm#grantprog
- 4. Currently developing a **stationary source fee schedule** for GHGs. This fee would apply to existing and future stationary sources permitted by the Air District that emit GHGs. At the proposed rate of 4.2¢ per ton of CO2, the fee would recover approximately \$1.1 million of the Air District's costs for Climate Protection Program activities that relate to stationary sources. Would be first GHG fee in the nation. Board hearings tentatively set for April 16 and June 4, 2008. The item will also go to committees on 2/27-Budget & Finance and 3/13- Climate Protection. http://www.baaqmd.gov/pln/ruledev/workshops.htm
- 5. In 2007, published *Opportunities for Further Greenhouse Gas Emission Reductions for the BAAQMD Stationary Sources*, an **analysis of options for mitigating greenhouse gases** from stationary sources permitted by BAAQMD. The study identified the industries and source categories which most significantly contribute to greenhouse gas emissions and potential mitigation options for controlling those emissions. The study qualitatively evaluated the effectiveness, costs, and impacts of each of the most promising options. See GHG Technology Study at http://www.baaqmd.gov/pln/BAAQMDMitigationStudyFinalReportMarch2007.pdf

As a follow up, the District is now working on a study called, Further Greenhouse Gas Reductions for the BAAQMD Stationary Sources, Phase II: Landfills; Industrial, Institutional and Commercial Boilers, Steam Generators and Process Heaters, which is expected to be published in the next few months.

- 6. Pilot testing 16-lesson **climate protection curriculum** for 4th/5th grade students in 10 schools in FY 07-08. Tentatively plan to expand to 40 classrooms in 08-09.
- 7. As of June 1, 2007, the Air District is a **climate neutral agency**. The Air District offset 1645 metric tons of CO2e emitted in 2006 with Native Energy Retailer in support of a renewable energy project. The District is also evaluating and implementing measures to reduce electricity and fuel consumption, and therefore greenhouse gas emissions, associated with District activities. See Climate Neutral at http://www.baaqmd.gov/pln/climatechange.htm#district
- 8. In December 2007, the Air District awarded \$3 million in **Climate Protection Grants** to 53 Bay Area local governments and nonprofits for implementation of innovative projects to reduce greenhouse gas emissions. Over 80 applications for funding were received, reflecting a tremendous amount of interest in pursuing climate protection and a need for this type of funding. For more info on award winners: http://www.baaqmd.gov/pln/climate_protection_grant_program.htm
- 9. Developing proposal with PG&E, ICLEI and other partners for a coordinated data

- web portal to help cities with data gathering for the development of communitywide GHG emission inventories at the jurisdiction level.
- 10. In FY 2007-08, the Air District is conducting a series of 8-10 **workshop sessions** with ICLEI to help local governments with climate protection. Workshops focus on different topics including: communitywide emission inventory development, municipal operations inventory development, and selection of greenhouse gas reduction strategies. Workshops are customized to fit local needs and resources.
- 11. The Air District is a sponsor for March 20 **CEQA workshop** conducted by Local Government Commission and Attorney General Office (one of 5 statewide). The first workshop will be held in Oakland on March 20th..
- 12. The Air District is currently discussing the development of a **best practices web portal** with Institute for Local Government to assist Bay Area local governments .
- 13. The Air District is currently working with the state agencies on their development of emission inventory **protocols** and the Scoping Plan (CAPCOA is on their advisory committee for LUSCAT, but our air district is not).
- 14. The District is exploring the potential for **2009 Climate Summit** that would highlight local governments.
- 15. Staff managed the production of a **CAPCOA white paper** on CEQA and greenhouse gas emissions. Website: http://www.capcoa.org/
- 16. The Air District is tentatively slated to receive **funding** for regional GHG mitigation activities under a settlement reached between the Attorney General and ConocoPhillips for a planned refinery expansion in Rodeo.
- 17. On March 5, the Air District submitted, in the name of the 4 regional agencies, a climate-related proposal for consideration in the RTP process.

San Francisco Bay Conservation and Development Commission Key Climate Change Activities March 2008

1. Commission adopted a **Strategic Plan** in October 2006 which included a goal to "play an integral role in developing and implementing a regional proactive strategy for dealing with global climate change." http://www.bcdc.ca.gov/index.php?cat=43

Subsequently, BCDC initiated the **Climate Change Planning Project** with 4 goals:

❖ Identify and report on the impacts of climate change on San Francisco Bay;

- Identify strategies for adapting to climate change;
- ❖ Develop a regional task force to inform and coordinate local governments, stakeholders, and land use planning bodies in the Bay area regarding the potential Bay-related impacts of and approaches for adapting to global climate change;
- ❖ Identify the findings and policies in the San Francisco Bay Plan pertaining to climate change, such as the findings and policies on sea level rise, and update other relevant Bay Plan policies to incorporate new information about the impacts of climate change.
- 2. Commission adopted **Climate Action Plan** in July 2007 with 3 goals:
 - ❖ Employ the full range of Commission's planning, regulatory and administrative authorities to address climate change issues
 - ❖ Facilitate broad Bay Area interest and participation in addressing the Bayrelated impacts of climate change to produce a sustainable, regional response that include specific adaptation measures;
 - ❖ Maximize BCDC's effectiveness and efficiency in addressing climate change issues through partnerships and collaboration with other organizations.
 - ❖ The plan contains 4 initiatives:
 - NOAA project to update Bay Plan and conduct Local Government Forum
 - o Coordination of climate change issues within all BCDC divisions
 - Regional planning—Delta Vision project, estuary-wide plan to address climate change, integration of adaptation strategies into new transitoriented shoreline developments.
 - Maximizing effectiveness through collaboration among 4 regional agencies, State and Federal governments, local governments, NGOs and the public

0

- 3. Report produced in October 2007 summarizing the challenge of climate change and sea level rise in the Bay Area and recommending a new **Regional Climate Change Strategy**. The report highlights BCDC and other agencies' lack of legal authority to address many of the issues around sea level rise and bay development. To remedy this, it proposes a "bold new plan for the Bay" that would be a pro-active adaptive management strategy. The proposed plan would be prepared by a regional agency partnership in cooperation with local governments with the JPC providing overarching management. The report outlines an 8-year, 10-step work program to develop and implement the plan, and proposes state legislation that would be required to expand BCDC and other agency authority.
- 4. In 2006 and 2007, produced 12 **sub-regional maps** showing projected 1-meter sea level rise impacts. Staff employed geographic information system software to identify the shoreline areas likely to be most impacted. The maps are generally consistent with the projections in the 2006 California Climate Action Team Report. They illustrate an impact scenario in which sea level rises one meter by the year 2100. Since limitations

in the geospatial data may effect accuracy, the maps are illustrative and are not intended for small-scale planning purposes. The maps are based on USGS 2005 Urban Areas digital elevations and National Agriculture Imagery Program 2004 aerials. http://www.bcdc.ca.gov/SF_Index_map.php

Currently working with USGS scientists on further refinements to the maps and to study and map all areas of the Bay filled historically to assess their vulnerability to liquefaction and spreading in a seismic event.

- 5. Conducted a set of structured interviews with selected coastal managers on **climate-related adaptation/preparation strategies** that builds on a 2006 survey of California coastal managers conducted by Susanne Moser for NCAR.
- 6. Currently finishing an \$800K grant application to Resources Agency (Coastal Impact Assistance Program) for research on the impacts of storm surge, "head of tide" migration due to sea level rise, and Bay sediment dynamics. This work will be linked to broader estuary issues/planning for both the nearby ocean and the Delta. The research will be done by staff and consultants.
- 7. Working on a new section on Climate Change featuring sea level rise for the July update to the **Bay Plan**. Current Bay Plan: http://www.bcdc.ca.gov/index.php?p=633
- 8. Partnering with ABAG and San Francisco Bay National Estuarine Research Reserve to plan a one-day conference for local governments on sea level rise, storm surge, vulnerability assessments and potential general plan policy approaches. The conference will be on Wednesday, April 16th at Metro Center and will feature local and statewide experts.
- 9. Collaborating with the Pacific Institute on a study to quantify the **economic value of Bay Area development** that is at risk to flooding from sea level rise and storm surge. This updates a similar study done by Pacific Institute in 1990.
- 10. Working on **adaptation issues** with the State's Climate Action Team and the CECled PIER program to ensure that resources are made available for vulnerability assessments and response strategies in the Bay Area.
- 11. Commenting on sea level rise and storm surge issues as part of their **review of environmental documents** for proposed shoreline development projects.

Metropolitan Transportation Commission Climate Change Activities March 2008

1. Overseeing the development of the **T-2035 Transportation Plan** (RTP) which

includes, for the first time, a CO2 target—Bay Area transportation CO2 reduced to 40% below 1990 levels by 2035. Currently, staff is focusing on identifying possible regional climate-related programs and developing the technical evaluation process for all RTP projects. The call for projects deadline is March 5. Also, staff is working with BAAQMD on possible RTP/climate projects. MTC will hold 2 workshops March 10 and 13 for input on scope and content of the EIR for the T-2035 plan. MTC is also monitoring the development of the Transit Strategic Vision for T-2035 by the transit operators. http://www.mtc.ca.gov/planning/2035_plan/nop.htm

- 2. MTC and ABAG have issued a call for applications for the **Station Area and FOCUS Planning grant program**. Stations areas along Resolution 3434 Transit lines and all FOCUS Priority Development Areas are eligible. Planning grants up to \$750,000 are available for localized planning efforts and associated environmental impact reports, and for specific plan elements. http://www.mtc.ca.gov/planning/smart_growth/#stations
- 3. MTC's **climate change program** features information gathering on 40+ transportation CO2 strategies in 4 categories—vehicle efficiency, infrastructure (transit, roads, bike/walk, smart growth, freight), behavior change and "Other." For each strategy, the resource document provides information on possible lead/support agencies, background data, existing real-world examples, impacts and costs (where available) and possible RTP action. In addition, MTC's climate-related work includes:
 - ❖ Cooperative effort with the Air District and other regional agencies on a climate proposal for the T2035 process.
 - ❖ Worked with partner agencies on workshops in 2007 on greenhouse gas emission strategies and the development of the regional climate action plan in May 2007.
 - ❖ Funding free transit on Spare the Air days in 2006 and 2007.
 - ❖ Co-sponsor role for BAAQMD's Regional Climate Summit (2006)
 - Funding and support for major steps to reduce diesel bus pollution through new hydrogen fuel-cell buses and \$30 million in retrofit exhaust filters for diesel bus fleets
- 4. MTC is exploring state legislation to allow a **10¢** per gallon gas fee to be placed on the ballot in the Bay Area at a future point.
- 5. MTC and Caltrans, in cooperation with partner agencies, are undertaking a **Regional High-Occupancy/Toll (HOT) Lanes Network** Feasibility and Implementation Study. The study is meant to determine whether a regional network of HOT lanes is warranted, define a phased implementation plan, and provide a regional context for demonstration projects under development in Alameda and Santa Clara counties. The study also will inform regional policies related to HOT lanes. MTC's long-range plan (Transportation 2030) proposes building on the existing HOV system to create a regional network of HOT lanes by converting existing HOV lanes to HOT lanes and expanding the HOV/HOT system where possible. The regional HOT lanes network is intended to:

- ❖ Make more efficient use of all freeway lanes;
- ❖ Provide a reliable travel option for express buses and carpools as well as those choosing to pay a toll;
- ❖ Generate a reliable revenue source that can be used to expand and connect the regional HOV network and expand express bus and rideshare services.

MTC also recently facilitated the development of the transit component of the HOT/BUS scenario with the region's transit operators. http://www.mtc.ca.gov/planning/hov/

- 6. MTC is working with BAAQMD on the development of a 2008 **public information campaign** on climate change and transportation.
- 7. Staff are **monitoring/advocating** in Sacramento for AB 32 Scoping Plan and land use/transportation climate strategies (SB 375, LUSCAT, UC Berkeley study, CTC etc.). Staff are discussing potential strategies with ARB and Caltrans staff. Legislative staff are also tracking the federal Lieberman-Warner climate bill S. 2191.
- 8. MTC's Transportation Awards recognize people and organizations who have made extraordinary contributions to the way people get around in the Bay Area each day. May 9th deadline for nominations. http://www.mtc.ca.gov/about_mtc/awards/index.htm

Bay Area Regional Agencies Climate Protection Program Assessment of Progress Relative to Recommendations May 2008

Goals

Recommendations	Progress
A. THAT the Bay Area regional agencies build their Joint Climate Protection Strategy in service of this Key Goal: <i>To be a model for California, the nation and the world</i> .	Adopted by JPC, July 20, 2007
B. THAT the Key Goal be pursued through four Supporting Goals:	Adopted by JPC, July 20, 2007
1. Prevention: To employ all feasible, cost- effective strategies to meet and surpass the State's targets of reducing greenhouse-gas emissions to 1990 levels by 2020 and to 80% below 1990 levels by 2050;	
2. Adaptation: To prepare the Bay Area for the consequences of climate change by planning cost-effective adaptations which safeguard health and safety and protect the region's environment, economy and equity;	
3. Learning: To measure and evaluate our results, continuously striving to improve;	
4. Communication: To document and publicize our actions and their impacts so that others may follow our lead.	

Strategy Element 1: Establish Priorities

Recommendations **Progress** C. THAT each of the regional agencies assign staff Agency staff members working on climate issues have resources to a continuing Bay Area Climate met together on an ad hoc basis and have begun to Protection Team to refine, implement, and evaluate identify core joint work items. Resource issues and the Joint Climate-Protection Strategy and assist in competing priorities have impeded formation of a more the selection of initiatives for inclusion in the structured team. This is being addressed through the Strategy. pending deployment of additional dedicated resources. D. THAT, to assist in evaluating alternative initiatives, Analysis for the regional transportation plan used MTC's travel model to assess the impact of alternative initiatives the Climate Protection Team test the feasibility of constructing a shared project assessment capability in reducing mobile-source CO₂ to target levels. (e.g., a Bay Area climate-protection model) from existing and planned intra- and inter-agency models, The Air District has published an analysis of inventories and analysis tools. Opportunities for Further Greenhouse Gas Emission Reductions for the BAAQMD Stationary Sources and is currently working on a phase-2 study. ABAG is exploring the use of greenhouse gas targets as a means for assessing the impact of the land-use assumptions underlying its policy-based Projections of population and jobs. These Projections are key drivers for the regional transportation and air quality plans. E. THAT the Climate Protection Team actively seek Staff is actively exploring several partnership opportunities to partner on climate-protection opportunities including a major multi-sector initiative initiatives with others from the public, private and with the Silicon Valley Leadership Group. voluntary sectors.

Recommendations	Progress
F. THAT the JPC sponsor workshops with relevant	While equity issues continue to play a large role in a
experts and stakeholders to identify the potential	number of regional initiatives related to climate change,
equity consequences of climate change and of	there has not yet been direct and independent action
mitigating strategies and to develop mechanisms to	resulting from this recommendation. As regional climate
compensate for these consequences if required.	initiatives capture center stage, this will be a priority.
G. THAT, pending the completion of a comprehensive	MTC and the Air District are sponsors of AB 2744
taxation and fee strategy (See Recommendation N),	(Huffman) which seeks authority for a regional gasoline
the regional agencies seek legislation permitting a	fee to fund climate initiatives.
small surcharge on an existing carbon-related fee or	
tax (most likely related to transportation); that	The Air District is developing a stationary source fee
surcharge to fund a program identified by the	schedule for greenhouse gases. The fees will fund the
Climate Protection Team and approved by the JPC	Air District's efforts to regulate stationary GHG
and member agencies and including, at minimum,	emissions.
technical assistance, planning and capital for	
prevention and adaptation, demonstration grants and	
extensive efforts to increase climate-protection	

Strategy Element 2: Increase Public Awareness and Motivate Action

awareness and behavior change.

Recommendation	Progress
H. THAT the Climate Protection Team, together with communication and public-information staff from each agency and in coordination with other organizations undertaking public climate programs, develop a climate-change awareness and action campaign—initially piggy-backing on existing communication efforts, but ramping up as new resources become available.	This summer's <i>Spare the Air</i> campaign will transition to an emphasis on climate protection, and the agencies are developing a more aggressive climate awareness and individual action campaign to follow from this beginning. The campaign will be designed to complement, not duplicate, campaigns from other organizations (e.g., Flex Your Power, PG&E, "We Can Solve It.")

Recommendation	Progress
	Of special note relative to public awareness is the grade
	4 and 5 curriculum being developed by the Air District.

Strategy Element 3: Provide Assistance

Rec	commendations	Progress
J.	THAT the regional agencies commission a study of protocols and best practices for incorporating greenhouse gas impacts into CEQA activities.	Air District staff managed the production of a California Air Pollution Control Officers Association (CAPCOA) white paper on CEQA and greenhouse emissions and was a sponsor of a CEQA workshop organized by Attorney General's Office and the Local Government Commission. The agencies anticipate participation in the CEQA guideline revisions to be undertaken by the Governor's Office of Planning and Research.
I.	THAT the Climate Protection Team, together with staff from existing regional technical assistance programs, explore assistance needs in detail with local governments and other relevant clients and develop a proposal for a consolidated regional assistance program which most efficiently meets collective needs.	The agencies will shortly be taking a survey of client needs in preparation for a rationalization of local-government assistance services among agencies and between the agencies and other long-standing as well as nascent service providers (e.g., ICLEI, Sustainable Silicon Valley, Sonoma County Climate Protection, the Local Government Commission, and the Institute for Local Government). The intent is to focus our efforts so as to concentrate on those services which the regional agencies are in the best position to deliver and to provide a single, common door to all the assistance services offered by the four regional agencies. The reconfigured assistance program will recognize and build upon the substantial regional-agency assistance services already in place, including:

Recommendations	Progress
	Green Business
	Energy Watch
	Climate Protection Grants
	Local Government Workshops (Air District on
	mitigation strategies; BCDC on adaptation to sea-
	level rise)
	Station-area Planning Grants.

Strategy Element 4: Reduce Driving and Promote Alternative Modes of Transportation

Red	commendations	Progress
K.	THAT, as part of the 2009 Regional Transportation Plan, staff identify the additional transportation measures, beyond implementation of Pavley vehicle standards, which will be required to reduce regional transportation-sector greenhouse-gas emissions to 1990 levels by 2020.	Vision work for the current RTP update has included an analysis of alternative investment and policy scenarios relative to an aggressive greenhouse-gas reduction target. Proposed projects are being evaluated relative to greenhouse-gas reduction targets.
L.	THAT climate change issues be integrated into the multi-agency FOCUS program and THAT climate-change criteria be included in the ranking of priority areas for incentive funding.	A draft set of performance criteria for FOCUS Priority Development Areas (PDAs) is currently being reviewed with PDA jurisdictions and other stake holders. The key criterion relates to the potential to reduce driving and associated CO ₂ emissions. The climate-change benefits of focused growth are referenced in nearly all presentations and communications on the FOCUS initiative.

Recommendations	Progress
M. THAT ABAG build upon its Federal and CEQA clearinghouse functions and upon its connections with local-government planning agencies to provide an early-warning system, identifying proposed private developments and public investments which are potentially inconsistent with regional climate-protection objectives and THAT these be brought to the attention of JPC for regional review and comment.	At the direction of its Administrative Committee, ABAG is considering a reinvigorated regional comment program. This includes a consideration of the role of the other agencies in pursuing the program.
N. THAT the regional agencies study and propose a comprehensive taxation and fee strategy to fund climate-protection efforts and to encourage travel behavior and location decisions sensitive to climate-protection objectives (Potential tax and fee elements include gasoline taxes and surcharges, vehicle fees, tolls and road pricing mechanisms, and indirect-source development fees.).	The RTP update includes an active consideration of transportation pricing strategies. As well, the JPC is undertaking a review of new revenue sources.

Strategy Element 5: Prepare to Adapt

Recommendation	Progress
O. THAT the Climate Protection Team assess and quantify the potential impacts of climate change on the Bay Area and develop a coordinated plan of actions to prepare for these; that plan to include at minimum infrastructure-investment and land-use-control strategies relevant to sea-level rise; air-pollution-control strategies relevant to air temperature increases and increased wild-fire incidence, and water storage and conservation	As detailed in its report of Key Climate Change Activities, BCDC (in cooperation with the other regional agencies) has been pursuing a very directed and aggressive program on adaptive responses to sea-level rise. Adaptive strategies in other areas are considerably less advanced. This is a significant issue and is a priority for resolution over the next year.

strategies relevant to reduced snow pack and saltwater intrusion.

Strategy Element 6: Break Old Habits

Red	commendation	Progress
P.	THAT the regional agencies maintain a continuing, publicly accessible inventory of potential climate change initiatives with current information on their evaluation or implementation status.	The ideas collected during the Air District Climate Summit and the JPC Climate Workshops remain publicly available on our websites; and MTC has compiled a document on over forty transportation-related CO ₂ strategies. All the agencies have continued to collect potential initiatives and best practices, and we are pursuing a common web portal which will provide current information on ideas and results.
Q.	THAT the Climate Protection Team form <i>ad hoc</i> task forces to study and develop recommendations relative to some of the shorter-range, more obvious and less expensive initiatives (e.g., incorporating greenhouse-gas considerations into CEQA) and THAT the longer-term, more contentious, more difficult, and more expensive strategies be subjected to modeling and other analysis to evaluate their relative feasibility and efficiency and to assess any equity impacts.	The Air District, on behalf of all the regional agencies, has submitted a set of climate-protection projects for evaluation as part of the current regional transportation plan (RTP) process. Other, longer-term strategies, have also been subjected to preliminary analysis as part of the RTP update. Equity impacts have been a big part of this analysis.
R.	THAT the agencies structure climate innovation ideas as packages, including both actions closely related to their existing formal authorities (i.e., ABAG with regard to housing development, BAAQMD relative to the regulation of stationary sources, BCDC with particular reference to the	To date, packages have largely related to existing authorities and responsibilities.

Recommendation	Progress
shoreline, and MTC pertinent to transportation	
finance) and as more speculative initiatives relying	
on more informal and potential joint authorities.	

RECOMMENDATIONS ADDED BY THE JOINT POLICY COMMITTEE AT ITS MEETING OF JULY $20^{\mathrm{TH}}, 2007$

Recommendations		
1 5	nsequences be integral to the climate-change adaptations and nitiatives.	Most initiatives are still at the conceptual stage. There have yet to be tangible consequences with equity impacts. Nevertheless, a consideration of equity has been at the forefront of all conceptual analysis and discussion.
transportation-sector	initiatives aimed at reducing r carbon emissions include at the railroad, maritime and air-	<i>&</i> 3